Comparison of four techniques for the routine diagnosis of *Trichomonas vaginalis* infection

P. R. Mason, Heather Super, and P. J. Fripp

*From the Department of Microbiology (Parasitology), School of Pathology, South African Institute for Medical Research and The University of the Witwatersrand, PO Box 1038, Johannesburg, South Africa*

**Synopsis** Specimens from 495 patients attending Johannesburg hospitals and family planning clinics were examined for *Trichomonas vaginalis* by microscopy of Giemsa (GS), Papanicolaou (Pap), and acridine-orange (AO) stained smears, and by culture in Feinberg-Whittington medium. Culture, Pap and GS stained smears from vaginal swabs yielded fewer positives than AO stained smears. Although Pap-stained cytological smears gave the highest number of positives, in 30% of these cases the presence of *T. vaginalis* could not be confirmed by examination of vaginal swabs. Of the positive AO-stained smears, 93% were also positive by at least one other technique.

Since the introduction of metronidazole for the treatment of trichomoniases (Durel *et al.*, 1960), a major problem in the control of this disease has been the accuracy of diagnosis (Hughes *et al.*, 1966). A large number of culture and staining techniques have been designed to increase the reliability of laboratory diagnoses. Rayner (1968) compared the (FW) medium of Feinberg and Whittington (1957) with the cysteine-peptone-liver-maltose (CPLM) medium described by Johnson and Trussel (1943). Rayner found that CPLM was the most reliable, and further observations (Rayner and Lowe, unpublished results quoted by Lowe (1972a)) described it as being as sensitive as a semi-solid agar (SSA) introduced by Lowe in 1965. Whittington (1957) had, however, previously described the FW medium as being more reliable than CPLM.

Hess (1969) found that a commercial *Trichomonas* medium (Oxoid No. 2) gave more positive isolations than did CPLM, but Lowe (1972a) found it less reliable than SSA. Cox and Nicoll (1973) found FW medium to be better than Oxoid No. 2.

Contradictory findings have also been published in comparisons of culture and microscopic techniques. Lowe (1972b) regarded cultural methods as being more sensitive than microscopy of either fresh or stained material, a view shared by Hess (1969) and McCann (1974). A number of authors (Woodcock, 1972; Morton, 1972), however, have found simple microscopy to be as reliable as culture. Lowe (1972b) regarded direct microscopy as being useful only in cases where rapid diagnosis was required.

For direct microscopy only fresh specimens are of value (McCann, 1974), and with the large numbers of patients attending gynaecological clinics, an ‘on the spot' examination of a vaginal swab is virtually impossible. Stained smears have the advantage that there can be considerable delay between preparation and staining and examination of a smear without loss of reliability in diagnosis, providing the smear has been adequately fixed. Specimens can thus be sent to a central laboratory for processing. Among the stains commonly used for *Trichomonas* diagnosis are Papanicolaou (Hughes *et al.*, 1966) and Giemsa (Freeman, 1958) or other Romanowsky stains (Lowe, 1972b).

Acridine orange (AO) is a compound which differentially stains DNA and RNA (Von Bertalanffy and Bickis, 1956); the former fluoresces yellow-green and the latter bright red under ultraviolet illumination. Dart and Turner (1959), in an examination of the application of AO to cytological staining, mentioned that *T. vaginalis* stained characteristically.

We have used AO in the routine laboratory diagnosis of trichomonal infections, and this report presents the results of a comparison between this technique and other stains (Giemsa and Papanicolaou) and culture on FW medium.

**Material and Methods**

**Specimens**

Vaginal swabs were obtained from patients attending...
the gynaecological outpatients department of the Johannesburg General Hospital, from patients in the gynaecological wards of hospitals in Johannesburg, and from family planning clinics. The swabs were kept in sterile physiological saline at room temperature until collection and were brought to the laboratory within three hours of being taken. Smears of the vaginal exudate were made on clean glass slides, after which the swab was put into a culture bottle, as described below.

**Giemsa Stain**

As soon as the smear was dry it was fixed by immersion for one minute in absolute ethanol and allowed to dry. The following day it was stained with Giemsa, diluted 1 part to 19 parts 1/15m phosphate buffer, pH 7.2 for 10 minutes. (Preliminary experiments had shown this to be the optimum dilution and staining time for *T. vaginalis.* After the stain had been washed off and the slide had dried, it was scanned for trichomonads at 160× magnification. At least 30 fields were examined before a negative finding was recorded.

**Papanicolaou Stain**

Cervical material for routine cytological examination was taken from about 60% of the patients from whom swabs had been taken. In these cases a copy of the cytologist's report was obtained and the presence or absence of trichomonal infection was noted. In those cases where cytological investigations were not required, smears were prepared from vaginal swabs and fixed while still wet with a commercial fixative (Fencott, Cape Town, South Africa). These smears were subsequently stained by a standard Papanicolaou method (Culling, 1963) and examined for *T. vaginalis* organisms.

**Acridine Orange**

Smears prepared for AO staining were not fixed and were stained the next day using a standard technique (Culling, 1963). The smears were examined immediately on a Zeiss fluorescence microscope, using a BG12 exciter filter, and 44 and 53 barrier filters. Details of this technique are given by Fripp *et al* (1975).

**Culture**

After the smears had been prepared, the swab was broken off and put into a culture bottle containing about 5 ml of Feinberg-Whittington medium and incubated at 36°C. Specimens were withdrawn from the medium at 48 hr, 72 hr, and 96 hr post-inoculation and examined for motile trichomonads.

**Results**

Of the 495 patients examined, 231 (47%) were found to be harbouring *T. vaginalis* by at least one of the four techniques used. The largest number of positive findings (171) was recorded with Papanicolaou-stained smears (table I), though this was not significantly different from the number (164) recorded with Acridine-orange stained smears (*χ*² = 0.16, *P* > 0.6). There were quite marked differences between the infection rates revealed by these two tests and with culture (109/495) and Giemsa-stained smears (95/495), both of which were negative in more than half the cases where trichomonads could be demonstrated by at least one other technique.

Comparison between those Papanicolaou stained smears examined parasitologically (Para-pap) and the cervical smears examined cytologically (Cytopap) also revealed marked differences. Of the former, 24% of 182 specimen were positive compared with 40% of 313 Cyto-paps.

In 8/44 (18%) of those Para-paps showing *T. vaginalis* the organisms were not demonstrated by any other test, compared with 38/126 (30%) of the Cyto-paps. Unconfirmed cases diagnosed by Giemsa-staining made up 4%, culture 3%, and acridine-orange staining 7% of their respective totals (table II).

**Discussion**

The highest percentage of positives in this comparison were found by examination of Papanicolaou-stained cervical smears. This is in agreement with the findings of Thin *et al* (1975) and Hughes *et al* (1966), who compared cytological, clinical, and culture techniques. The comparison between Para-pap and Cyto-pap smears confirmed the suggestion by Hughes *et al* (1966) that the advantages lie in the collection of the specimen rather than the stain used.

In the present study, infection rates in Para-pap smears (24%) were similar to those demonstrated by culture (22%) and Giemsa-staining (19%). Although the highest rates were recorded by Cyto-pap examination, only 70% of these could be confirmed by other techniques, whereas 93% of positive AO-stained smears were positive by other methods. Perl (1972) found that *T. vaginalis* could not be cultured from 37% of 666 patients diagnosed as having an infection by examination of Papanicolaou-stained cervical smears. On the basis of her results she suggested that positive findings in such examinations should be treated with reserve. Re-examination of cervical smears was possible in 24 cases in the present study, and *T. vaginalis*...
Table I Diagnosis of T. vaginalis from vaginal swab and cytological smears

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stain</th>
<th>No. of Specimens examined</th>
<th>No. Positive</th>
<th>% Positive of Total Positives by Any Test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Giemsa</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Para-pap'</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyto-pap'</td>
<td>313</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acridine-orange</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II Cases of T. vaginalis infection confirmed by at least one other method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stain</th>
<th>No. Positive</th>
<th>Confirmed No. Positive</th>
<th>Confirmed Positives as % of Total Positives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Giemsa</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Para-pap'</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyto-pap'</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acridine-orange</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We wish to thank the medical staff of the hospitals and clinics who assisted in the collection of specimens, and Dr A. Berry of the Cytology Department, South African Institute for Medical Research, for valuable assistance.

References


Comparison of four techniques for the routine diagnosis of Trichomonas vaginalis infection


Reports and Bulletins prepared by the Association of Clinical Biochemists

The following reports and bulletins are published by the Association of Clinical Biochemists. They may be obtained from The Publishing Department, British Medical Journal (ACB Technical Bulletins), B.M.A. House, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR. Overseas readers should remit by British Postal or Money Order.

SCIENTIFIC REPORTS (price £1.00/$2.00 each)


4 An Evaluation of five Commercial Flame Photometers suitable for the Simultaneous Determination of Sodium and Potassium March 1970 P. M. G. BROUGHTON and J. B. DAWSON

SCIENTIFIC REVIEWS (price £1.00/$2.00 each)

1 The Assessment of Thyroid Function March 1971 F. V. FLYNN and J. R. HOBBS


3 Biochemical Tests for the Assessment of Fetalplacental Function May 1975 C. E. WILDE and R. E. OKEY

TECHNICAL BULLETINS (price £1.00/$2.00 each)

9 Determination of Urea by AutoAnalyzer November 1966 RUTH M. HASLAM

11 Determination of Serum Albumin by AutoAnalyzer using Bromocresol Green October 1967 B. E. NORTHAM and G. M. WIDDOWSON

13 An Assessment of the Technicon Type II Sampler Unit March 1968 B. C. GRAY and G. K. MCgowan

14 Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy: an outline of its principles and a guide to the selection of instruments May 1968 J. B. DAWSON and P. M. G. BROUGHTON


16 A Guide to Automation in Clinical Chemistry May 1969 P. M. G. BROUGHTON

17 Flame Photometers: a comparative list of 17 instruments readily available in Britain August 1969 P. WILDING

19 Spectrophotometers: a comparative list of low-priced instruments readily available in Britain May 1970 C. E. WILDE and P. SEWELL

20 Quantities and Units in Clinical Biochemistry June 1970 P. M. G. BROUGHTON

21 Filter Fluorimeters: A comparative list of 18 instruments September 1970 H. BRAUNSBERG and S. S. BROWN

22 Bilirubin Standards and the Determination of Bilirubin by Manual and Technicon AutoAnalyzer Methods January 1971 BARBARA BILLING, RUTH HASLAM, and N. WALD

23 Interchangeable Cells for Spectrophotometers and Fluorimeters September 1971 S. S. BROWN and A. H. GOWENLOCK

24 Simple Tests to Detect Poisons March 1972 B. W. MEADE et al.

25 Blood Gas Analysers May 1972 K. DIXON

26 Kits for Enzyme Activity Determination September 1972 S. B. ROSALIK and D. TARLOW

27 Assessment of Pumps Suitable for Incorporation into Existing Continuous Flow Analytical Systems November 1972 A. FLECK et al.

28 Routine Clinical Measurements of Transferrin in Human Serum September 1973 K. DIXON

29 Control Materials for Clinical Biochemistry (5th edition) September 1973 J. F. STEVENS

30 Notes on the Quality of Performance of Serum Cholesterol Assays September 1973 S. S. BROWN

31 Determination of Uric Acid in Blood and in Urine July 1974 R. W. E. WATTS

32 A Survey of Amino Acid Analysers Readily Available in the United Kingdom September 1974 J. E. CARLYLE and P. FURKISS

33 Definitions of some Words and Terms used in Automated Analysis November 1974 A. FLECK, R. ROBINSON, S. S. BROWN, and J. R. HOBBS

34 Measurement of Albumin in the Sera of Patients January 1975 LINDA SLATER, P. M. CARTER, and J. R. HOBBS


36 Factors influencing the Assay of Creatinine November 1975 J. G. H. COOK
Comparison of four techniques for the routine diagnosis of Trichomonas vaginalis infection.

P R Mason, H Super and P J Fripp

doi: 10.1136/jcp.29.2.154

Updated information and services can be found at:
[http://jcp.bmj.com/content/29/2/154](http://jcp.bmj.com/content/29/2/154)

Email alerting service

Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to:
[http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions](http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions)

To order reprints go to:
[http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform](http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform)

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
[http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/](http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/)